

Environmental Impact
Assessment:
The Provincial Experience
The Role of Environmental Health in
Ontario's Environmental Assessment
Process

Theresa McClenaghan
Canadian Environmental Law
Association

Mississaugas of the New Credit

- Proposal: Hagersville Tire Fire Cell
- Also, Long term waste disposal site
- Major existing operational problems, especially including landfill odour
- Environmental Assessment Act initially
- Insisted on Environmental Protection Act too

Health Issues

- Is tire fire waste a threat?
- Will it contaminate drinking water wells?
- Is landfill gas odour a health threat?
- Pesticides disposal at site

Health Evidence

- Hydrogeologist & landfill engineer
- Technical review
- Comparison to zero impact; not just to guidelines
- Long term water supply key
- Existing site's operational problems of greatest concern

Outcome

- Accepted tire fire waste; stringent monitoring etc.
- Water supply negotiated
- Operational improvements, especially groundwater & landfill gas
- Trust fund
- Zero discharge onto First Nation
- Pesticides remain a concern

STORRINGTON LAND FILL

Environmental Assessment Act
Environmental Protection Act

Proposal

- 25 year long term waste disposal for Kingston & large surrounding area
- To be re-opening of recently closed site, and major expansion

Health Issues

- Existing major landfill gas odours
- Existing major leachate seepage from surface
- Lack of treatment of leachate; groundwater contamination & local wells
- Rideau fish contamination
- Major social impacts
- Major litter events
- Proposed treatment after expansion using unproven technology

Health Evidence

- Well & groundwater monitoring & predictions
- Adequacy of treatment options
- Landfill gas monitoring
- Social impacts surveys
- Photos & videos of seepage, litter

Outcome

- Full hearing held
- Many experts; long hearing
- Board approved but for only 7 years
- Major control conditions including landfill gas controls; much improved treatment
- Property value & other novel conditions
- Site never re-opened because cost did not justify the term granted
- Proponent had to clean up anyway because of prosecutions

Eastview (Guelph)

Environmental Protection Act

Proposal

- Existing, operating site that was slated to close
- Five year expansion sought pending long term solution

Health Issues

- Ground water contamination & drinking wells
- Landfill gas & nearby residents
- Major social disruption due to reliance on promised closure dates

Health Evidence

- Groundwater monitoring & interpretation
- Comparisons to Reasonable Use Guidelines
- Residents' anecdotes re: social disruption
- Property valuation
- Landfill Gas monitoring

Outcome

- Site approved by Board with strict conditions as to closure; subsequently set aside by Court
- Site now the choice for long term solution
- Community cynical
- Landfill gas & groundwater controls in place

DEMAND SUPPLY PLAN - ONTARIO HYDRO

ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT
BOARD

PROPOSAL

- 25 YEAR PLANNING APPROVAL
- ONTARIO'S ENERGY NEEDS FOR 25 YEAR HORIZON
- MY INVOLVEMENT IN NUCLEAR PANEL

HEALTH ISSUES

- TRITIUM RELEASES TO WATERWAYS
- CARBON-14 EMISSIONS TO AIR
- POSSIBILITY OF SEVERE ACCIDENTS & OFFSITE RELEASES

HEALTH EVIDENCE

- ONTARIO HYDRO PANEL EXPERTS (CROSS EXAMINATION)
- NUCLEAR POWER, RADIATION HEALTH & OTHER RELATED EXPERTS
- HIGHLY QUALIFIED WITNESSES & REPORTS (ALL AVAILABLE)

OUTCOME

- PLAN WAS WITHDRAWN BEFORE THE HEARING WAS COMPLETED
- TWO TO THREE YEARS OF HEARINGS
- NO DECISION
- MUCH EVIDENCE COMPILED & REMAINS OF INTEREST FROM ALL PARTIES
- A HEALTH COALITION (BERTELL, FRANKLIN, ETC.) WAS FORMED

BLACKWELL ROAD LANDFILL

ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION
ACT

PROPOSAL

- EXISTING INDUSTRIAL LANDFILL TO BE EXPANDED & CONTINUED BEYOND CLOSURE DATES
- HAD BECOME COMPLETELY SURROUNDED BY RESIDENTIAL COMMUNITY

HEALTH ISSUES

- TAKING INDUSTRIAL WASTE WITH ODOUR PROBLEMS
- CLAIMS OF HEALTH IMPACTS
- MAJOR DUST EVENTS
- SOCIAL DISRUPTION IN THE COMMUNITY

HEALTH EVIDENCE

- COMPLAINTS RECORDS
- RESIDENTS' ANECDOTES
- DISPOSAL RECORDS
- MONITORING
- TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF PROPOSED CONTROLS & MITIGATION

OUTCOME

- STRICTLY DEFINED CLOSURE
- SEPARATE AGREEMENT
- STRINGENT CONTROL ON DISPOSALS
- STRINGENT MONITORING
- EXTENSIVE CONTINGENCIES
- TRUST & COMMUNITY FUNDS
- END USE SAY
- PROPERTY VALUE
- BETTER ODOUR CONTROL

WEST OF LONDON TRANSMISSION

ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT ACT

PROPOSAL

- A NEW MAJOR TRANSMISSION LINE TO RUN CHATHAM - LONDON
- TO ALLOW GREATER EXCHANGE WITH U.S. MARKETS

HEALTH ISSUES

- QUESTIONS WERE BEING RAISED ABOUT TRANSMISSION LINES & LIVESTOCK; ALSO HUMAN HEALTH
- INDIRECT AIR QUALITY EFFECTS FROM ADDITIONAL PURCHASES FROM U.S. COAL PLANTS AS IMPLIED

HEALTH EVIDENCE

- BOARD VERY RESISTANT TO HEALTH ISSUES
- HOWEVER, WAS PUT ON ISSUES LIST

OUTCOME

- PLAN WITHDRAWN BEFORE HEARING COMPLETED
- NO DECISION MADE BY BOARD

QUINTE LANDFILL

ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT ACT (NEW ACT)

PROPOSAL

- TO MINE OLD LANDFILL; THEN TO RE-FILL AND EXPAND
- AT BAY OF QUINTE; ALSO OFF MAIN RUNWAY OF TRENTON AIR FORCE BASE
- REMEDIATION OF OLD SITE WAS CONTENTED NEED BY PROPONENT; WAS DENIED BY MOE & RESIDENTS

HEALTH ISSUES

- AIR QUALITY IMPACTS FROM MINING
- EMPLOYEE SAFETY
- LANDFILL GAS
- GROUNDWATER & LOCAL WELLS
- MAJOR SOCIAL DISRUPTION
- MAJOR HEALTH & SAFETY ISSUES TO FLIGHT STAFF & LOCAL RESIDENTS FROM BIRD STRIKES

HEALTH EVIDENCE

- GROUNDWATER MONITORING & PREDICTIONS
- EXTENSIVE FLIGHT SAFETY EVIDENCE, ESPECIALLY FROM DND
- RESIDENTS' ANECDOTES
- PROPERTY VALUE & SOCIAL EVIDENCE
- LANDFILL GAS PREDICTIONS

OUTCOME

- HEARING PROCEEDED FOR SEVERAL MONTHS
- PROPONENT EVENTUALLY WITHDREW THE APPLICATION
- SITE WILL REMAIN CLOSED
- AN EXAMPLE OF "NATURAL ATTENUATION"
- COMMUNITY FEELS VINDICATED